

MINUTES

CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

DECEMBER 20, 2010

The City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met upon the above date at 5:30 p.m., Chairman Harold Sanger presiding. Upon roll call, the following responded:

Present:

Chairman Harold Sanger
Steve Lichtenfeld, Aldermanic Representative
Craig S. Owens, City Manager
Jim Liberman
Ron Reim

Absent:

Marc Lopata
Scott Wilson

Also Present:

Susan Istenes, Director of Planning & Development Services
Jason Jaggi, Senior Planner
Kevin O'Keefe, City Attorney

Chairman Sanger welcomed everyone to the meeting. He asked that all cell phone ringers be turned off or muted and that conversations take place outside the room so as not to disrupt the meeting. He announced that new recording equipment has been installed and will be used for this meeting for the first time and asked everyone wishing to speak on the record to please speak into the microphones, which must be on to ensure proper recording.

MINUTES

The minutes of the December 6, 2010 meeting were presented for approval. The minutes were approved, after having been previously distributed to each member.

SUBDIVISION PLAT/LOT CONSOLIDATION – 7449-51 BLAND AVENUE.

Tony Wurm, civil engineer representing Charles Farris, owner, was in attendance at the meeting.

Susan Istenes explained that this is a request for consideration of a subdivision plat which will consolidate portions of three (3) lots into one (1) new lot located in the Northmoor Park Addition Subdivision for the purpose of constructing an addition to the existing residential dwelling

at 7451 Bland Avenue. Lot 12, addressed 7451 Bland Avenue contains a single family dwelling and a detached garage. The vacant parcel to the north addressed 7449 Bland Avenue contains portions of Lots 10 and 11 as originally platted in the Northmoor Park Subdivision. St. Louis County owns the remaining portions of Lots 10 and 11 as right-of-way for the Forest Park Parkway. The plat, as presented, will consolidate all of Lot 12 and a portion of Lots 10 and 11, Block 11 of the Northmoor Park Addition subdivision into one lot. The following provides a summary of the land area subject to the consolidation:

PART OF LOT 10	PART OF LOT 11	ALL OF LOT 12	NEW LOT 12
1,257 Square Feet	5,633 Square Feet	8,796 Square Feet	15,686 Square Feet

The proposed plat will allow the owner of these two parcels to have a single piece of property for the purpose of constructing an addition in conformance with the zoning regulations which require one primary building per lot. The remaining portions of Lots 10 and 11 not subject to this plat will continue to function as County right-of-way for the Forest Park Parkway. Susan indicated that staff recommends approval of the lot consolidation plat to the Board of Aldermen with the following conditions:

1. That the applicant provide a Mylar for the appropriate City of Clayton signatures per the Subdivision Ordinance requirements after Board of Aldermen approval; and
2. That the applicant file the plat with the St. Louis County Recorder of Deeds office and submit proof of filing to the City within thirty (30) days of Board of Aldermen approval.

Mr. Wurm stated that staff's comments are accurate.

Chairman Sanger asked if the applicant has purchased property from the County.

Mr. Wurm replied "yes". He added that the owners desire to construct a small addition on to the north side of their existing residence and need this consolidation to do so.

Chairman Sanger asked if there were any questions or comments from the remaining members and/or the audience.

None were received.

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to recommend approval per staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by Jim Liberman and unanimously approved by the members.

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT – KETTLEBELL STUDIO – 7618 WYDOWN BOULEVARD
(2ND FLOOR OF AL'S WYDOWN CLEANERS)

Loren Shelton, business owner/occupant, was in attendance at the meeting.

Susan Istenes explained that this is a request for a Conditional Use Permit for the operation of a Kettlebell and Z-Health training studio in the Hanley/Wydown Business District. This property is zoned C-1 Neighborhood Commercial District. Fitness studios or health clubs are not specifically listed as allowable uses in the C-1 District; however, academies are listed as an allowable use subject to the approval of a Conditional Use Permit. Additionally, there is a fitness studio, Muscle-Up Fitness, which has been operating in this commercial district since the mid-1990's. Staff believes that a fitness studio is a very closely-related type of business as a karate or dancing academy and therefore falls within the category of a conditional use. This space was originally built as an apartment; however, staff has been informed that a yoga studio was operating out of the space for several years. The applicant is proposing to operate a Kettlebell and Z-Health studio above Al's Wydown Cleaners. Kettlebell training involves the use of kettlebell weights in a workout regimen. Z-Health is a specialized exercise system that focuses on joint movements. The studio measures 1,200 square feet in size. No significant interior renovations are proposed to utilize the space as a studio. The plans show three (3) studio rooms; however, the applicant has indicated to staff that the third studio will not be used. The proposed hours of operation are Monday through Friday 6:00 AM to 7:00 PM and Saturday from 9:00 AM to noon or by appointment. Sundays are by appointment only. The surrounding uses in the Hanley/Wydown Business District (and also zoned C-1) consist of several restaurants, a fitness center and general retail establishments. Above the first floor, some of the buildings contain residential units on the second floor. The building located at 7642 Wydown Boulevard contains residential apartments on the second floor; however, these two buildings are separated by solid masonry walls. Multi-family residential properties located within the R-6 Medium Density Multi-Family zoning district are located to the south along Forest Court. The applicant is required to provide parking at 1 space for each 300 square feet for a total of four (4) spaces. These spaces are required to be located within 500 feet of the property. To date, the applicant has not provided proof of securing these off-street spaces. The submitted plan has been reviewed and the space has been inspected by a building inspector and the Fire Marshall. The inspection of the space revealed a few minor violations to the City's maintenance code which involve minimal repairs. These items are anticipated to be corrected within 30-days. In addition, the plans, as presented, meet the requirements of the Building Code. The proposed Kettlebell Z-Health Studio will create additional parking demand within the Hanley/Wydown Business District. The City has received comments from an adjacent business expressing concerns with the lack of parking in the area. The applicant as well as staff has spoken with St. Louis Parking Company about the availability of spaces at the Hanley/Wydown parking lot and the spaces located adjacent to Wydown Park. Unfortunately, these permit spaces do not experience frequent turnover and are currently leased out to other businesses in the area. The applicant has indicated to staff that he is pursuing parking arrangements with the Central Presbyterian School at 700 South Hanley Road and the Westway Cleaners at 500 South Hanley Road to lease parking spaces. To date, the applicant has not provided proof of securing these off-street spaces. Susan stated that staff is of the opinion that the issue of parking in the Hanley/Wydown Business District is not confined to this particular application. This area does not have a large supply of off-street parking. Instead, the business district relies on a large amount of on-street parking and small amounts of metered spaces at the Hanley/Wydown lot which are shared amongst the businesses on a first-come-first-served basis. Many of the commercial buildings in this business district do not contain off-street parking. With this in mind, staff believes that the applicant should make every effort to provide the required amount of four (4) off-street parking spaces and provide proof to the City. If the applicant can provide substantial evidence that these spaces are not available for lease, staff would support a waiver of these spaces due to the lack of available parking in the area for lease. In terms of compatibility, there is an existing similar use, a fitness and training facility, located at 7622 Wydown, across Forest Court. While there are

residential units in the second floor of an adjacent building, staff does not believe that the noise associated with this use will be disruptive to these residents due to the masonry wall separating the two buildings and the location of the main studio not being located adjacent to this wall. Susan indicated that staff recommends approval of the conditional use permit to the Board of Aldermen with the following conditions:

1. That the applicant obtain a commercial occupancy permit
2. That the occupant provide four (4) off-street parking spaces and that proof of these spaces be provided to the Department of Planning and Development. The Director of Planning and Development Services is authorized to waive this requirement only upon receiving substantial evidence that the above required parking spaces are not available for lease.
3. That the applicant obtain approval of a sign permit prior to installation of any exterior signage.

Chairman Sanger asked how the number of spaces were determined.

Susan Istenes indicated that one space for every 300 square feet is required by Code.

Mr. Shelton indicated that they have obtained the 4 spaces from Westway Cleaners and informed the members of what a “kettlebell” is. He stated that the maximum number of people in the unit at any given time, including the trainers, is 10. He added that usually there are only one to two people at a time when they do single sessions.

Chairman Sanger asked how long they have been in operation.

Mr. Shelton replied 6 weeks.

Chairman Sanger noted that permits are needed to conduct business.

Mr. Shelton concurred and stated that this is their first business venture and they are trying to catch-up.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the kettlebells get dropped.

Mr. Shelton stated that is not part of the training but sometimes they do slip. He indicated that they do have padded flooring.

Chairman Sanger asked if anyone from Wydown Cleaners was in attendance.

Dennis Indelicato (Al’s son) was in the audience. He stated that his father could not attend.

Jim Liberman asked about ADA accessibility.

Jason Jaggi indicated that the City’s Building Official reviewed the plans and noted that this is exempt as long as they are not making any alterations to the space, and the drawing submitted by the applicant does not include alterations.

Mr. Indelicato commented that it is a unique way of working out. He stated that there are several different size balls and it is like a swinging exercise using your entire body; no equipment as found in traditional work out places like Muscle-Up Fitness.

Chairman Sanger asked how the cleaners gets along with kettlebell training above their ceiling. He asked if he has any issue with it.

Mr. Indelicato stated that there is no issue.

Ms. Nancy Pritchard, 315 N. Meramec Avenue. She stated that she and her husband have been clients of Loren's for 2 ½ years and he is the best trainer she has ever had. She stated that she thinks it is great addition to the community of Clayton and promotes health and wellness. She stated that she strongly supports this business.

Mr. Luke Pritchard stated that he has never dropped a kettlebell and supports the use as well.

Robert Sheryl, 7622 Wydown (Muscle-Up Fitness). He began by stating that he has opposed this business, especially in light of the fact that they did not receive a permit to operate. He stated that parking is his biggest issue here. He said that at 6 a.m. and 7 a.m. last Saturday every parking space was taken. He stated that he believes that they are both living and operating a business out of this unit. He stated that the parking will be bad for his customers. He stated that there is no rear fire escape from this unit in the event of a fire, but that is not his concern. He stated that a disabled person cannot get to this unit, but that, too, is not his business. He then showed and distributed a photograph of a kettlebell and a class that was held outside.

Chairman Sanger stated that he finds it difficult to believe that parking will be much different in light of the fact that they have obtained 4 off-street parking spaces.

Mr. Sheryl stated that unless someone visits the area, they do not know about the parking problems.

Chairman Sanger thanked Mr. Sheryl for his comments and informed him that as long as they comply with City ordinances, which they are doing, it is not in this Commission's position to deny the request.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked the previous use of this unit.

Susan Istenes stated that staff was told that a yoga studio previously occupied the unit, but that has not been confirmed. She stated that at some point, staff believes it was used as an apartment.

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to recommend approval per staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by Jim Liberman and unanimously approved by the members.

SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – NEW CONSTRUCTION – ADDITION TO SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE – 10 RIDGEMOOR

Wally Council, owner, was in attendance at the meeting. Also in attendance was Bruce Korn, contractor.

Susan Istenes explained that the proposed project consists of a two-story addition and renovation to an existing two-story single family residence. The proposed 2,509 square foot addition exceeds 50 percent of the square footage of the existing 4,779 square foot residence; therefore, Site Plan Review is required. The site measures 18,568 square feet and is located in the Claverach Park Subdivision. On December 2, 2010, the Board of Adjustment granted a variance for a one (1) foot encroachment into the required side yard setback to the north. The existing residence encroaches one (1) foot into the northern setback requirement; the northern façade of the proposed second story addition will be flush with the existing first floor northern façade. The applicant indicates that the height of the proposed residence will be twenty-six feet and four inches (26'4") as measured from the average existing grade to the midpoint of the roof. The existing site contains 31.9 percent impervious area. The new plans show impervious coverage at 29.6 percent. The existing storm water runoff is 0.98 cubic feet per second (cfs) and will be reduced to 0.95 cfs with the removal of a rear yard paved area. Downspouts and a driveway inlet will connect to a rear yard detention structure with an emitter near the southeast corner of the subject property. Trash will be stored off of the rear drive turnaround and will be screened by a four feet, ten inch (4'10") brick veneer retaining wall with a wood gate. The applicant is also proposing to locate HVAC units at the rear of the residence to be screened by a stacked stone retaining wall with a maximum height of four (4) feet. Electric service is proposed to be moved underground. Thirteen (13) deciduous, twelve (12) evergreen and three (3) street trees will remain and will not be impacted by the proposed construction. Three (3) ornamental deciduous trees totaling six (6) caliper inches and one (1) medium deciduous tree measuring thirty-two (32) caliper inches will remain and will require adequate protection. One (1) ornamental deciduous tree measuring three (3) caliper inches and two (2) evergreen trees are proposed to be removed and will require replacement. Two (2) large and one (1) ornamental deciduous trees are proposed to be planted to replace the removed trees. The existing rear yard paved area will be removed to accommodate the proposed addition, a bluestone patio and an exposed aggregate driveway turnaround. The overall decrease in impervious area on the subject property will also cause a decrease in storm water runoff from the subject property. Runoff from the rear is being mitigated via a chamber structure with an emitter near the southeast property corner. Susan indicated that staff's recommendation is to approve the site plan as proposed.

Mr. Council began a PowerPoint presentation. He informed the members that he and his wife have been in this 2,800 square foot house for 10 years and now have a 6 year old son and 2 year old daughter as well as a lot of town visitors; in a 3 bedroom 2 bath house it gets a bit tight. He indicated that they looked at alternatives, including purchasing a larger home even out of Clayton, but they want to remain in Clayton and want to add on to their existing home. He stated that their plan will preserve and reclaim greenspace as well as one which is most considerate of their neighbors.

Chairman Sanger asked about the square footage numbers, existing and proposed.

Mr. Council explained that their house, according to tax records, is 2,800 square foot (does not include garage space). He stated that 4,800 square foot will be one of the bigger homes in Claverach Park, but not the biggest. A slide depicting the existing structure was presented. Mr.

Council pointed out an addition that was built probably shortly after the house was constructed and explained some of the existing materials. He stated that the addition will be 100% masonry; that it will also have a tile roof and leaded glass windows; continuing all of the things that make the house what it is today. A slide depicting the proposed front elevation was presented. He indicated that initially, they were not going to build over the garage, but in order to achieve the living space they need, it is necessary. He indicated that they will convert the garage to a family room and add a master bath and another bedroom and bath above the garage. He stated that the total roof height will not be above the existing roof height. Mr. Council provided a brief explanation of the variance that was granted by the Board of Adjustment on December 2nd, explaining that the second story addition above the existing garage will line up with the garage which is between 4" and 11.10" over the setback line.

A slide depicting the street view with the addition was presented. He stated that they are fortunate to have one of the larger lots in Claverach Park at almost ½ acre and that his neighbors at #8 and #12 are very supportive of their proposal.

A slide depicting the proposed site plan was presented. Mr. Council noted that two large evergreens will have to be removed; one on the south and one on the northeast. The trees needing protection were also noted, a Ginko tree and three small dogwoods at the southwest corner. He noted that impervious coverage is actually being decreased with this project and that the view of his neighbor's at #8 will be improved as they will no longer look at trash, but will have a view of a patio and landscaping. He stated that his neighbors on the other side will also have an improved view.

Slides of the front and rear elevations were shown. Mr. Council stated that the bulk of the addition is on the rear. He explained that although it cannot be seen on the elevations, there is a 17 foot wide section of the house that contains the existing kitchen and 2nd floor bedroom that will be converted to a hallway to provide access to the new master bedroom/bathroom. He stated that they will try and be as "green" as possible, reusing materials for the addition. He then explained the floor plan and indicated that the new retaining wall will be dry stack stone as is existing and that the existing tiles above the garage and bump-out will be re-used. He stated that the entire driveway will be exposed aggregate.

Chairman Sanger advised Mr. Council that the materials can be presented and discussed during the architectural review portion of the meeting.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked how the emitter at the southeast corner of the property will affect drainage onto adjacent properties to the south and east.

Mr. Council stated that the current topography slopes from the northwest corner (highest point) to the southwest corner (lowest point) so the drainage goes to the southeast corner of the yard and believes this will be an improvement over existing conditions.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked when water comes out of the emitter if it will go to a storm drain.

Mr. Council stated that there is a storm drain in the common area which catches water from the property as it is today and will continue to do so. He stated that they will ensure that that drainage goes to that storm drain and not onto the street or other areas.

Chairman Sanger asked if the pipe to the emitter is solid or serrated so water gets dispersed...

Mr. Council stated that he believes it is solid to the serration so there are emitters that run down the side of the yard. He then referred to the drainage detail on the plans, noting that the pipe is solid and then perforated. He noted that currently, their downspouts drain to the sewer and their goal was to eliminate that situation.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked about the existing stone wall (rectangle).

Mr. Council indicated that the rectangle is a tiered yard that brings up the low point and brings down the high point so they can play in their yard.

Mr. Alan Morris stated that he lived in this house from 1969 to 1973 and in 1972 they planned a similar addition, but instead moved to #8 Southmoor. He stated that he believes this to be a wonderful addition to the neighborhood

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to approve the site plan as presented. The motion was seconded by Jim Liberman and unanimously approved by the members.

The architectural aspects of the project were now up for review.

Susan Istenes explained that the existing home is a tan brick and stone, two story structure and measures 4,779 square feet including the attached garage. The proposed two story addition will measure 2,509 square feet, and the total size of the residence with the proposed addition will be 7,288 square feet. The addition will be constructed of tan brick and stone to match the existing residence. The applicant is proposing to enlarge the existing first floor kitchen and breakfast room to the rear. Second story bedrooms will be added and expanded. The applicant indicates that the height of the proposed residence will be twenty-six feet and four inches (26'4") as measured from the average existing grade to the midpoint of the roof. Red clay tiles will cover the roof of the proposed addition and will match the existing. Trash will be stored off of the rear drive turnaround and will be screened by a four foot and ten inch (4'10") brick veneer retaining wall with a wood gate. The applicant is also proposing to locate HVAC units at the rear of the residence to be screened by a stacked stone retaining wall with a maximum height of four (4) feet. An existing below grade, attached garage will be converted to a family room. An attached, below grade, side entry, two and a half (2.5) car garage with carriage style doors is proposed. An existing rear yard paved area will be removed to accommodate the proposed addition. A bluestone patio and exposed aggregate driveway turnaround are proposed in the rear yard. Susan indicated that Claverach Park Trustee approval has been submitted, that staff believes that the addition blends well with the existing structure and recommends approval as submitted.

Mr. Council informed the members that all new materials will match pretty well. He stated that he had a brick sample but forgot to bring it. He stated that it may be a bit difficult to match the tuck pointing color exactly. He stated that they will attempt to re-use as much existing brick as possible.

Chairman Sanger asked Susan Istenes if staff needs to look at the brick before construction begins.

Susan Istenes replied “no”; staff is comfortable with their proposal.

Mr. Council informed the members that he would like the front elevation to be done with the existing brick so at least that part of the addition that is seen from the front blends in.

Chairman Sanger asked the timeline of the project.

Mr. Korn stated he hopes to be completed in 7 months, weather permitting.

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to approve as submitted. The motion was seconded by Jim Liberman and unanimously approved by the members.

Chairman Sanger complimented Mr. Council on his excellent presentation.

Jim Liberman asked about the Centene garage.

Susan Istenes indicated that a modification to the wind wall will be on the January 3rd agenda.

Jason Jaggi added that the applicant desires to reduce the amount of the wind-wall.

A brief discussion regarding the upcoming Wydown Middle School project took place.

Jim Liberman asked what happens if this Commission does not approve the site plan for the project.

Kevin O’Keefe stated that a 2/3 majority by the School Board would trump a negative recommendation by this Commission.

Being no further business for the Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board, this meeting adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

Recording Secretary